

**Wilson J (Jim)**

---

**From:** Euan Page [Euan.Page@equalityhumanrights.com]  
**Sent:** 12 December 2008 16:37  
**To:** Criminal Justice and Licensing Bill  
**Subject:** Consultation Response  
**Attachments:** Revitalising\_Justice\_Consultation[1].doc

Please find attached the Equality and Human Rights Commission's comments on the Revitalising Justice consultation.

Regards

Euan Page  
Parliamentary & Government Affairs Manager  
Equality and Human Rights Commission Scotland  
Optima Building  
58 Robertson Street  
Glasgow  
G2 8DU

tel: 0141 228 5971  
m: 07890 324318

Helpline Tel: 0845 604 5510  
Helpline Textphone: 0845 604 5520  
Helpline Fax: 0845 5530  
Website: [www.equalityhumanrights.com](http://www.equalityhumanrights.com)

---

We are currently consulting on our three-year strategic plan and equality scheme, and looking at ways we can shape our grants programme in line with our strategic priorities. To find out more visit: [www.equalityhumanrights.com/consultations](http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/consultations)

Our vision

A society built on fairness and respect. People confident in all aspects of their diversity.

Legal disclaimer

This email has been originated in the Equality and Human Rights Commission, which is an information and guidance service and not a legal advice service. If you require legal advice, please contact a solicitor. This paragraph does not apply to an individual who is assisted under section 28 Equality Act 2006.

This email message, including any attachments, is from the Equality and Human Rights Commission and is intended for the addressee only. It may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance of it.

Security warning: Please note that this email has been created in the knowledge that Internet email is not a 100% secure communications medium. We advise that you

understand and accept this lack of security when emailing us.

If this email message has been sent to you in error, please notify us immediately by replying to this email. The Equality and Human Rights Commission accepts no responsibility for any changes made to this message after it has been sent by the original author. This email or any of its attachments may contain data that falls within the scope of the Data Protection Acts. You must ensure that any handling or processing of such data by you is fully compliant with the requirements of the Data Protection Act 1984 and 1998.

The Equality and Human Rights Commission was established by the Equality Act 2006 as the Commission for Equality and Human Rights.

This email was received from the INTERNET and scanned by the Government Secure Intranet anti-virus service supplied by Cable&Wireless in partnership with MessageLabs. (CCTM Certificate Number 2007/11/0032.) In case of problems, please call your organisation's IT Helpdesk. Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

\*\*\*\*\*  
This email has been received from an external party and  
has been swept for the presence of computer viruses.  
\*\*\*\*\*

## **Revitalising Justice Consultation – Response from the Equality and Human Rights Commission in Scotland**

### **Introduction**

- 1** The Equality and Human Rights Commission was established by the Equality Act 2006 and came into being on 1 October 2007. We are the independent advocate for equality and human rights across the three nations of Great Britain, and we work to reduce inequality, eliminate discrimination, strengthen good relations between people, and promote and protect human rights. We enforce equality legislation on age, disability, gender, gender reassignment, race, religion or belief, and sexual orientation and encourage compliance with the Human Rights Act. In Scotland, we co-locate and work in partnership with the Scottish Commission for Human Rights.
- 2** The Commission welcomes the opportunity to comment on the proposals on the Revitalising Justice consultation. In its first year, the Commission in Scotland has been very active on criminal justice in Scotland, and has given written and oral evidence on both the Sexual Offences (Scotland) Bill and the Offences (Aggravation by Prejudice) (Scotland) Bill. We have also commissioned research on policy responses to gender-based crime in Scotland, which we hope to publish in spring 2009. Our approach in these pieces of work has informed our response to the *Revitalising Justice* consultation.
- 3** The consultation contains a wide range of proposals, some of which will require further discussion with stakeholders before the Commission can arrive at firm conclusions. We will however take this opportunity to flag areas likely to be of interest or concern, and which are likely to feature in our response to next year's Criminal Justice and Licensing (Scotland) Bill.

### **The Consultation Proposals**

- 4** The Commission supports many of the consultation's proposals, including proposals for more appropriate secure accommodation for "unruly" children, reform on antisocial behaviour law to tackle human trafficking and child sexual exploitation, clarification of the law on territorial extent in human trafficking cases, more straightforward procedures for obtaining

criminal Non-Harassment Orders, a new “significant sexual element” criterion for extending sentences, clarifying and tightening the law on indecent images of children, review of the thresholds for application of a Sexual Offences Prevention Order, and moves to address the role alcohol plays in crime as well as in potential mitigating factors. In addition, there are a number of proposals which raise specific concerns.

- 5 **Possession of extreme pornographic material:** the consultation proposes mirroring, with some modifications, Section 63 of the Criminal Justice and Immigration Act 2008. This follows the joint Scottish Executive/Home Office consultation of 2005<sup>i</sup>. Many submissions to that consultation raised important questions about how to define “extreme” pornography, and suggested that there are clear links between all pornography and wider gender inequality. Women’s organisations have pointed to studies which implicate pornography at every stage of the sexual abuse cycle, from predisposing men to abuse, to legitimating abuse, to reducing internal and external inhibitions to abuse, and in initiating and carrying out abuse<sup>ii</sup>.
- 6 There is then a strong argument to be made for the objective harm caused by all pornography, and on the disproportionate impact on women and children of crimes where the consumption of pornography was a contributory factor. It has indeed been suggested that pornography should be classified as incitement to gender hatred in a way similar to existing provisions on race hatred<sup>iii</sup>.
- 7 Against these arguments, both the 2005 consultation and the passage of the 2008 Act in England and Wales prompted protests that the criminal law should not intrude into regulating the private sexual activity of consenting adults, however unorthodox or distasteful certain acts may be to others. Parallels have been drawn with the 1957 Wolfenden Report on decriminalising homosexual practices which concluded that

“It is not, in our view, the function of the law to intervene in the private life of citizens, or to seek to enforce any particular pattern of behaviour.”<sup>iv</sup>

- 8 The consultation's proposals must therefore be seen against the background of a complex and unresolved debates about, on the one hand, the objective harm done to individuals and society by all forms of pornography, and on the other, the limits of state interference in citizens' private lives. The Commission will be seeing further input from our stakeholders in Scotland on these issues, and it will be important to learn from the recent debates at Westminster in developing approaches.
- 9 **A new community supervision sentence:** the Commission believes that there is scope to draw policy links between this proposal and the provisions of the Offences (Aggravation by Prejudice) (Scotland) Bill currently being considered by the Scottish Parliament. The 2004 Report on the Working Group on Hate Crime<sup>v</sup>, which led to the Bill, recommends that "sentencers should make greater use of alternative disposals for people convicted of hate crimes" and that ministers "should consider research to identify which alternative disposals are successful" (recommendation 10).
- 10 The Commission believes that community supervision sentences could represent a useful option for a non-custodial alternative, perhaps with a restorative element, for some offences aggravated by the kinds of factors detailed in the Bill. This would also seem to fit with the recommendations of the Scottish Prisons Commission, which stated in its report earlier this year that

"It cannot be beyond our imagination to think of better ways of imposing punishment, of deterring offenders and others, of sending messages about right and wrong, of getting people to payback for their crimes, of repairing harm and of helping troubled people lead law-abiding lives. Some of these approaches can and should involve the offender having to give up something they value (their reputation, their money, their privacy, their free time, their freedom), some of them can and should involve the offender in paying back positively through facing up to what they have done, apologising, compensating the victim, doing unpaid work for the community, or working hard at tackling the problems behind their offending. In some cases, where both victim and offender are willing, restorative justice practices may have an important role to play." [3.4]<sup>vi</sup>

- 11** The Equality and Human Rights Commission believes strongly that this approach could be particularly effective in addressing the attitudes and values which motivate what is sometimes referred to as “hate crime”, and hopes that ministers will reflect this in their approaches both to the Offences (Aggravation by Prejudice) Bill, and in their response to the Prisons Commission report.
- 12 Recording of racial and religious hate crime aggravations:** this is the final area on which the Commission would like to comment. We welcome proposals to ensure that crime motivated by hostility or ill will towards actual or perceived sexuality, transgender identity or disability will be recorded in the same way as is currently the case for offences covered by Section 96 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 or Section 74 of the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2003.
- 13** The Commission believes that robust recording mechanisms are an essential component to the successful use of statutory aggravations, not least because recording is central to identifying patterns of offending behaviour and consequent tailored interventions to deal with the underlying causes.

**Equality and Human Rights Commission**  
**December 2008**

For further information, please contact **Euan Page, Parliamentary & Government Affairs Manager**: 0141 228 5971;  
[euane.page@equalityhumanrights.com](mailto:euane.page@equalityhumanrights.com)

---

#### **Refeneces/Endnotes**

<sup>i</sup> Home Office/Scottish Executive, *Consultation: On the possession of extreme pornographic material*, August 2005

---

<sup>ii</sup> Scottish Women's Convention, response to Home Office/Scottish Executive Consultation, November 2005:

[www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/1099/0021439.pdf](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/1099/0021439.pdf)

<sup>iii</sup> See Scottish Women Against Pornography (SWAP), Spring 2005 Newsletter, [www.swapcampaign.co.uk/Newsletter\\_2005.doc](http://www.swapcampaign.co.uk/Newsletter_2005.doc)

<sup>iv</sup> Cited in Scottish Executive Justice Department, *Analysis of the Scottish Responses to the joint Scottish Executive and Home Office consultation on the possession of extreme pornographic material*, June 2006, [www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Justice/criminal/17543/ExtremePornographicMaterial](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Justice/criminal/17543/ExtremePornographicMaterial)

<sup>v</sup> Scottish Executive, *Working Group on Hate Crime Report*, September 2004, [www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/26350/0025008.pdf](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/26350/0025008.pdf)

<sup>vi</sup> Scottish Government, *Scotland's Choice: Report of the Scottish Prisons Commission*, July 2008  
[www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/230180/0062359.pdf](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/230180/0062359.pdf)



**Wilson J (Jim)**

---

**From:** Wilson J (Jim)  
**Sent:** 15 December 2008 15:56  
**To:** 'Euan Page'  
**Subject:** RE: Consultation Response

Euan,

Many thanks for your response. As your paper covers quite a few separate topics, I have forwarded on your response to the respective policy areas for consideration. I thought it would be useful to provide you with some contacts details.

Ann Oxley from our Sexual Offences Branch covers possession of extreme pornography material  
Brian Cole from our Community Justice Services Branch covers new community supervision sentence  
Sara Stewart from our Sentencing policy unit covers recording of racial and religious hate crime aggravations

Should you need to get in touch, happy for you to use me as a contact point, I can then liaise accordingly with the appropriate policy lead.

Regards,

Jim

0131 244 7050

**Jim Wilson**

**Scottish Government**

Criminal Law and Licensing Division

Criminal Justice Directorate

**Scotland's licensing laws are changing. To access important information on the Licensing (Scotland) Act 2005 please click on the licensing micro site at:**

**<http://www.infoscotland.com/licensingact/>**

---

**From:** Euan Page [mailto:Euan.Page@equalityhumanrights.com]

**Sent:** 12 December 2008 16:37

**To:** Criminal Justice and Licensing Bill

**Subject:** Consultation Response

Please find attached the Equality and Human Rights Commission's comments on the Revitalising Justice consultation.

Regards

Euan Page  
Parliamentary & Government Affairs Manager  
Equality and Human Rights Commission Scotland  
Optima Building  
58 Robertson Street  
Glasgow

23/02/2009

G2 8DU

tel: 0141 228 5971

m: 07890 324318

Helpline Tel: 0845 604 5510

Helpline Textphone: 0845 604 5520

Helpline Fax: 0845 5530

Website: [www.equalityhumanrights.com](http://www.equalityhumanrights.com)

---

We are currently consulting on our three-year strategic plan and equality scheme, and looking at ways we can shape our grants programme in line with our strategic priorities. To find out more visit: [www.equalityhumanrights.com/consultations](http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/consultations)

#### Our vision

A society built on fairness and respect. People confident in all aspects of their diversity.

#### Legal disclaimer

This email has been originated in the Equality and Human Rights Commission, which is an information and guidance service and not a legal advice service. If you require legal advice, please contact a solicitor. This paragraph does not apply to an individual who is assisted under section 28 Equality Act 2006.

This email message, including any attachments, is from the Equality and Human Rights Commission and is intended for the addressee only. It may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not copy, distribute or take any action in reliance of it.

Security warning: Please note that this email has been created in the knowledge that Internet email is not a 100% secure communications medium. We advise that you understand and accept this lack of security when emailing us.

If this email message has been sent to you in error, please notify us immediately by replying to this email. The Equality and Human Rights Commission accepts no responsibility for any changes made to this message after it has been sent by the original author. This email or any of its attachments may contain data that falls within the scope of the Data Protection Acts. You must ensure that any handling or processing of such data by you is fully compliant with the requirements of the Data Protection Act 1984 and 1998.

The Equality and Human Rights Commission was established by the Equality Act 2006 as the Commission for Equality and Human Rights.

This email was received from the INTERNET and scanned by the Government Secure Intranet anti-virus service supplied by Cable&Wireless in partnership with MessageLabs. (CCTM Certificate Number 2007/11/0032.) In case of problems, please call your organisation's IT Helpdesk. Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

\*\*\*\*\*  
This email has been received from an external party and has been swept for the presence of computer viruses.  
\*\*\*\*\*